

Overall Recommendation

Accept with Minor Revisions

Rating: 7/10

Principal Findings

Dimension	Assessment
Theoretical framework	Strong integration of Thompson, Hobsbawm, Gramsci, Scott, Tilly, Tarrow with Brazilian scholarship
Historiographical balance	Excellent handling of populism versus labour pact debate
Periodisation	Coherent five-period structure with appropriate analytical justification
Bibliography	Comprehensive but dated (engagement largely terminates c. 2000s)
Methodological reflection	Insufficient for a historiographical survey
Treatment of final period (1985-1989)	Comparatively thin; identity movements underanalysed

Required Revisions

1. Incorporate scholarship from the past two decades, particularly intersectional approaches
2. Expand analysis of rural movements beyond Hobsbawm's "primitive rebels" framework
3. Add methodological discussion regarding sources for subaltern history
4. Strengthen Section VI on redemocratisation and identity movements
5. Clarify terminological choices (popular/subaltern/working classes)

Conclusion

A competent historiographical synthesis suitable for orienting readers to Brazilian social history debates. Valuable for its English-language accessibility to Portuguese-language scholarship. Contribution lies primarily in synthesis rather than original interpretation.